

1 DANIEL L. WARSHAW (Bar No. 185365)
dwarshaw@pswlaw.com
2 BOBBY POUYA (Bar No. 245527)
bpouya@pswlaw.com
3 MATTHEW A. PEARSON (Bar No. 291484)
mapearson@pswlaw.com
4 **PEARSON, SIMON & WARSHAW, LLP**
15165 Ventura Boulevard, Suite 400
5 Sherman Oaks, California 91403
Telephone: (818) 788-8300
6 Facsimile: (818) 788-8104

7 Attorneys for Plaintiff James Eashoo

8 NEWPORT TRIAL GROUP
9 A Professional Corporation
Scott J. Ferrell, Bar No. 202091
10 sferrell@trialnewport.com
David W. Reid, Bar No. 267382
11 dreid@trialnewport.com
Richard H. Hikida, Bar No. 196149
12 rhikida@trialnewport.com
4100 Newport Place Drive, Ste. 800
13 Newport Beach, CA 92660
Tel: (949) 706-6464
14 Fax: (949) 706-6469

15 Attorneys for Defendant
16 IOVATE HEALTH SCIENCES U.S.A., INC.

17 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
18 CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

19
20 JAMES EASHOO, individually and on
behalf of all others similarly situated,

Case No. 2:15-cv-1726-BRO(PJWx)

21 Plaintiff,

CLASS ACTION

22 vs.

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER

23 IOVATE HEALTH SCIENCES U.S.A.,
24 INC.

25 Defendant.

1 1. **PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS**

2 Disclosure and discovery activity in this action are likely to involve production
3 of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from
4 public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation
5 may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the court
6 to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this
7 Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery
8 and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the
9 limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the
10 applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section
11 12.3, below, that the Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file
12 confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures
13 that must be followed and the standards that will be applied with a party seeks
14 permission from the court to file material under seal.

15 Sealing must be justified for each individual item to be sealed or redacted;
16 blanket claims of confidentiality are not allowed and will result in a denial of the
17 application to seal. Counsel is strongly encouraged to consider carefully whether
18 sealing or redaction is required for a given piece of evidence or argument. The
19 inclusion of clearly meritless requests to seal or redact documents may result in the
20 complete rejection of an application to seal.

21 2. **DEFINITIONS**

22 2.1 **Challenging Party:** a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation
23 of information or items under this Order.

24 2.2 **“CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items:** information (regardless of
25 how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection
26 under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c).

27 2.3 **Counsel (without qualifier):** Outside Counsel of Record and House
28 Counsel (as well as their support staff).

1 2.4 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or
2 items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as
3 "CONFIDENTIAL."

4 2.5 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of
5 the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,
6 among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or
7 generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

8 2.6 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter
9 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an
10 expert witness or as a consultant in this action.

11 2.7 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this action.
12 House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside
13 counsel.

14 2.8 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or
15 other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

16 2.9 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party
17 to this action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this action and have
18 appeared in this action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which
19 has appeared on behalf of that party.

20 2.10 Party: any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors,
21 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their
22 support staffs).

23 2.11 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
24 Discovery Material in this action.

25 2.12 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support
26 services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
27 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)
28 and their employees and subcontractors.

1 2.13 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
2 designated as "CONFIDENTIAL."

3 2.14 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material
4 from a Producing Party.

5 3. SCOPE

6 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only
7 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted
8 from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of
9 Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties
10 or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material. However, the protections
11 conferred by this Stipulation and Order do not cover the following information: (a)
12 any information that is in the public domain at the time of disclosure to a Receiving
13 Party or becomes part of the public domain after its disclosure to a Receiving Party as
14 a result of publication not involving a violation of this Order, including becoming part
15 of the public record through trial or otherwise; and (b) any information known to the
16 Receiving Party prior to the disclosure or obtained by the Receiving Party after the
17 disclosure from a source who obtained the information lawfully and under no
18 obligation of confidentiality to the Designating Party. Any use of Protected Material at
19 trial shall be governed by a separate agreement or order.

20 4. DURATION

21 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations
22 imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees
23 otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be
24 deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this action, with or
25 without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and exhaustion
26 of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this action, including the time
27 limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to
28 applicable law.

1 5. **DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL**

2 5.1 **Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.**

3 Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this
4 Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies
5 under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for protection
6 only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that
7 qualify – so that other portions of the material, documents, items, or communications
8 for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of
9 this Order.

10 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations
11 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper
12 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber or retard the case development process or to
13 impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) expose the Designating
14 Party to sanctions.

15 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it
16 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must
17 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

18 5.2 **Manner and Timing of Designations.** Except as otherwise provided in
19 this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise
20 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection
21 under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or
22 produced.

23 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

24 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic
25 documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial
26 proceedings), that the Producing Party affix the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" to each
27 page that contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a
28 page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the

1 protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

2 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents or materials available for
3 inspection need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has
4 indicated which material it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and
5 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be
6 deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting Party has identified the documents
7 it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents,
8 or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing the
9 specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the “CONFIDENTIAL” legend
10 to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of the
11 material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly
12 identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the
13 margins).

14 (b) for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial or trial proceedings,
15 that the Designating Party identify on the record, before the close of the deposition,
16 hearing, or other proceeding, all protected testimony.

17 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for
18 any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the
19 exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the
20 legend “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information or item
21 warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the
22 protected portion(s).

23 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
24 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the
25 Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such material.
26 Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable
27 efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this
28 Order.

1 6. **CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS**

2 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a
 3 designation of confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a Designating
 4 Party's confidentiality designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial
 5 unfairness, unnecessary economic burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the
 6 litigation, a Party does not waive its right to challenge a confidentiality designation by
 7 electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the original designation is disclosed.

8 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute
 9 resolution process by providing written notice of each designation it is challenging
 10 and describing the basis for each challenge. To avoid ambiguity as to whether a
 11 challenge has been made, the written notice must recite that the challenge to
 12 confidentiality is being made in accordance with this specific paragraph of the
 13 Protective Order. The parties shall attempt to resolve each challenge in good faith and
 14 must begin the process by conferring directly (in voice to voice dialogue; other forms
 15 of communication are not sufficient) within 14 days of the date of service of notice. In
 16 conferring, the Challenging Party must explain the basis for its belief that the
 17 confidentiality designation was not proper and must give the Designating Party an
 18 opportunity to review the designated material, to reconsider the circumstances, and, if
 19 no change in designation is offered, to explain the basis for the chosen designation. A
 20 Challenging Party may proceed to the next stage of the challenge process only if it has
 21 engaged in this meet and confer process first or establishes that the Designating Party
 22 is unwilling to participate in the meet and confer process in a timely manner.

23 6.3 Judicial Intervention. If the Parties cannot resolve a challenge without
 24 court intervention, the Designating Party shall file and serve a motion to retain
 25 confidentiality under Civil Local Rule 7-4 through 7-8 (and in compliance with Civil
 26 Local Rule 79-5, if applicable) within 21 days of the initial notice of challenge or
 27 within 14 days of the parties agreeing that the meet and confer process will not resolve
 28 their dispute, whichever is earlier. Each such motion must be accompanied by a

1 competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet and
2 confer requirements imposed in the preceding paragraph. Failure by the Designating
3 Party to make such a motion including the required declaration within 21 days (or 14
4 days, if applicable) shall automatically waive the confidentiality designation for each
5 challenged designation. In addition, the Challenging Party may file a motion
6 challenging a confidentiality designation at any time if there is good cause for doing
7 so, including a challenge to the designation of a deposition transcript or any portions
8 thereof. Any motion brought pursuant to this provision must be accompanied by a
9 competent declaration affirming that the movant has complied with the meet and
10 confer requirements imposed by the preceding paragraph.

11 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge shall be on the Designating
12 Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass
13 or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the
14 Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived the
15 confidentiality designation by failing to file a motion to retain confidentiality as
16 described above, all parties shall continue to afford the material in question the level
17 of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the
18 court rules on the challenge.

19 7. **ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

20 7.1 **Basic Principles.** A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
21 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this case
22 only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Such Protected
23 Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions
24 described in this Order. When the litigation has been terminated, a Receiving Party
25 must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

26 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a
27 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons
28 authorized under this Order.

1 7.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless
2 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a
3 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated “CONFIDENTIAL”
4 only to:

5 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this action, as well
6 as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to
7 disclose the information for this litigation;

8 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the
9 Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and
10 who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

11 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom
12 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the
13 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

14 (d) the court and its personnel;

15 (e) court reporters and their staff, professional jury or trial consultants,
16 mock jurors, and Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary
17 for this litigation and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be
18 Bound” (Exhibit A);

19 (f) during their depositions, witnesses in the action to whom disclosure is
20 reasonably necessary and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to
21 Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered
22 by the court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that
23 reveal Protected Material must be separately bound by the court reporter and may not
24 be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order.

25 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a
26 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

27 ///

28 ///

1 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN
2 OTHER LITIGATION

3 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation
4 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this action as
5 “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

6 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall
7 include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

8 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to
9 issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or
10 order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this
11 Stipulated Protective Order; and

12 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued
13 by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

14 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with
15 the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this
16 action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the
17 subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s
18 permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking
19 protection in that court of its confidential material – and nothing in these provisions
20 should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this action to
21 disobey a lawful directive from another court.

22 9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED
23 IN THIS LITIGATION

24 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a
25 Non-Party in this action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information
26 produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the
27 remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be
28 construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

1 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to
2 produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is
3 subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's
4 confidential information, then the Party shall:

5 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party
6 that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement
7 with a Non-Party;

8 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated
9 Protective Order in this litigation, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably
10 specific description of the information requested; and

11 (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-
12 Party.

13 (c) If the Non-Party fails to object or seek a protective order from this court
14 within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving
15 Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the
16 discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving
17 Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to
18 the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court.
19 Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense
20 of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

21 10. **UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

22 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed
23 Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this
24 Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in
25 writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts
26 to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or
27 persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order,
28 and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and

1 Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

2 11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE
3 PROTECTED MATERIAL

4 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain
5 inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection,
6 the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil
7 Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure
8 may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior
9 privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the
10 parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or
11 information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the
12 parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted to
13 the court.

14 12. MISCELLANEOUS

15 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any
16 person to seek its modification by the court in the future.

17 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this
18 Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to
19 disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this
20 Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any
21 ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

22 12.3 Filing Protected Material. Without written permission from the
23 Designating Party or a court order secured after appropriate notice to all interested
24 persons, a Party may not file in the public record in this action any Protected Material.
25 A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material must comply with Civil
26 Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court
27 order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at issue. Pursuant to
28 Civil Local Rule 79-5, a sealing order will issue only upon a request establishing that

1 the Protected Material at issue is privileged, protectable as a trade secret, or otherwise
2 entitled to protection under the law. If a Receiving Party's request to file Protected
3 Material under seal pursuant to Civil Local Rule 79-5 is denied by the court, then the
4 Receiving Party may file the information in the public record unless otherwise
5 instructed by the court.

6 **13. FINAL DISPOSITION**

7 Within 60 days after the Producing Party's written request after final disposition
8 of this action, as defined in paragraph 4, each Receiving Party must return all
9 Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this
10 subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, compilations, and any other
11 format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether the Protected
12 Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written
13 certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the
14 Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where
15 appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms
16 that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations,
17 summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material.
18 Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all
19 pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda,
20 correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product,
21 and consultant and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected
22 Material. Any such archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material
23 remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

24 ///

25 ///

26 ///

27 ///

28 ///

1 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.
2
3

4 DATED: April ___, 2015
5
6

PEARSON, SIMON & WARSHAW, LLP
DANIEL L. WARSHAW
BOBBY POUYA
MATTHEW A. PEARSON

7 By: /s/Daniel L. Warshaw
8 DANIEL L. WARSHAW
9 Attorneys for Plaintiff James Eashoo,
10 individually and on behalf of all others
similarly situated
11
12

DATED: April 14, 2015
13
14

NEWPORT TRIAL GROUP
SCOTT J FERRELL
DAVID W. REID
RICHARD H. HIKIDA

16 By: /s/ Scott J. Ferrell
17 SCOTT J. FERRELL
18 Attorneys for Defendant Iovate Health Sciences
19 U.S.A., Inc.
20
21

I, Scott J. Ferrell, hereby certify that the content of this document is
acceptable to all persons required to sign this document and that I obtained the
authorizations necessary for the electronic signatures of all parties for this
document.

24 By: /s/Scott J. Ferrell
25 Scott J. Ferrell
26
27
28

1 PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.
2
3

4 DATED: April 17, 2015



5 Hon. Patrick J. Walsh
6 United States Magistrate Judge
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

EXHIBIT A

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ [print or type full name], of _____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the Central District of California on [date] in the case of *Eashoo v. Iovate Health Sciences U.S.A., Inc.*, Case No. 2:15-cv-1726. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

14 I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court
15 for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this
16 Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after
17 termination of this action.

18 I hereby appoint _____ [print or type full name] of
19 _____ [print or type full address and
20 telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with
21 this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective
22 Order.

23 || Date: _____

24 City and State where sworn and signed: _____

25 || Printed name:

26 ||

27 || Signature: